Consultation Response Summary

Harrogate

	Very Positive (%)	Positive (%)	Neutral (%)	Negative (%)	Very Negative (%)	Don't Know (%)
Harrogate						
N Station Parade	38.5	15.1	7.3	9.1	29.3	0.6
One Arch	43.3	27.6	14.3	5.6	7.4	1.8
East Parade/Bower Road	39.5	18.5	12.2	10.1	19.2	0.5
Station Square	42.3	17.2	8.9	9.8	21.4	0.4

	Full Pedestrianisation (%)	Partial Pedestrianisation (%)	Retain vehicular access (%)	Neither (%)
James Street	45.5	16.6	32.0	6.0

	1 Lane (%)	2 Lane (%)	Neither (%)
Station Parade	49.1	26.7	24.2

Skipton

	Very Positive (%)	Positive (%)	Neutral (%)	Negative (%)	Very Negative (%)	Don't Know (%)
Skipton						
Railway Station	41.8	30.8	6.2	11.0	10.3	0
Broughton Road	24.3	30.6	17.1	10.8	17.1	0
Canal Route	55.7	29.1	7.6	5.1	2.5	0
Leisure Centre Link	50.6	26.6	10.1	8.9	3.8	0
Gas Street	45.0	24.0	21.0	4.0	5.0	1.0
Carleton Street	34.7	33.7	16.8	6.3	4.2	4.2
Black Walk	50.5	37.4	8.1	2.0	2.0	0

Gallows Bridge	37.8	36.7	21.4	1.0	1.0	2.0

Selby

	Very Positive (%)	Positive (%)	Neutral (%)	Negative (%)	Very Negative (%)	Don't Know (%)
Selby						
Station Plaza	47.2	23.3	19.5	4.4	5.0	0.6
Station Road 1 way 20mph	38.6	31.0	17.7	7.0	5.7	0.0
Eastern Station Access	47.3	31.2	11.8	5.4	2.2	2.2
Ousegate 1 Way	36.4	20.6	11.2	11.2	18.7	1.9
Close Denison Bridge to vehicles	23.5	22.4	18.4	22.4	13.3	0.0
Shipyard Road low traffic route	41.8	22.4	22.4	8.2	5.1	0.0

Refurbish Wharf	53.0	23.0	18.0	2.0	4.0	0.0
Bridge	48.5	24.2	15.2	4.0	8.1	0.0

	New Underpass (%)	Use existing Arch (%)	Neither (%)
Bawtry Road	39.0	48.6	12.4

	Bowling Green (%)	Play Area (%)	Neither (%)
Park Path	44.3	29.1	26.6

	Pitched Roof (%)	Pavilion (%)	Curved Roof (%)	None (%)
Station Building	45.6	16.5	31.9	6

Harrogate Highlight Themes

	1 Lane	2 Lane	Neither
Station Parade	49.1% (459)	26.7% (250)	24.2% (226)

2 Lane or neither option Theme	Response
Traffic Flow and congestion	Concerns centred on impacts to traffic flow and the potential for congestion by making Station Parade 1 Lane. Traffic modelling has been undertaken to help understand the possible outcomes. A worst case scenario was developed by inflating traffic levels to 2023 (from a 2018 baseline) using regional levels of growth (In the period 2013 – 2018 Harrogate showed flat growth) and looking at the busiest time of day which is the afternoon peak (4.45pm – 5.45pm). It is considered that this approach represents a robust assessment of traffic levels. The modelling estimates that the worst case impacts on traffic congestion at the 2023 opening date of a 1 Lane Station Parade could be an increase in average journey time across the town centre of 53 seconds per vehicle with James Street part pedestrianised or 1minute 14 seconds per vehicle with James Street fully pedestrianised at all times.

	These scenarios do not take into account the anticipated benefits of increased modal shift as a result of this and other active travel schemes and changes to patterns of travel post COVID.
Impact on local businesses	Concerns were based on the perception that trade relies on the ability to drive into and park in the town centre. The proposal retains the ability to drive into the town centre, subject to the impacts discussed within the modelling and also to park in the town centre. Whilst some parking spaces would be lost to accommodate the scheme, it will still be possible to park in the town centre. Parking studies indicate a significant surplus (500 spaces) in the town centre during most of the year and at peak occupancy there are 120 unused on street spaces.
Impact on local residents	There are concerns that traffic redistributing from Station Parade would impact upon residents of neighbouring streets. The modelling undertaken predicts that under the peak period there could be a reassignment of c. 200 vehicles away from Station Parade in the peak hour. This is split across a number of alternative routes; the level of increase potentially seen on any street is less than 3 vehicles per minute.

	Very Positive	Positive	Neutral	Negative	Very Negative	Don't Know
N Station Parade	**38.5 (360)**	**15.1 (141)**	**7.3 (68)**	**9.1 (85)**	**29.3 (274)**	**0.6 (6)**

Negative Responses Theme	Response
Traffic Flow and congestion	Concerns centred on impacts to traffic flow and the potential for congestion by making Northern Station Parade 1 Way. The modelling estimates that the worst case impacts on traffic congestion at the 2023 opening date of this option delivered with a 1 lane Station Parade could be an increase in average journey time across the town centre of 53 seconds per vehicle with James Street part pedestrianised or 1minute 14 seconds per vehicle with James Street fully pedestrianised at all times. These scenarios do not take into account the anticipated benefits of increased modal shift as a result of this and other active travel schemes and changes to patterns of travel post COVID. Data shows that almost half of all trips being made, in the busiest periods, both start and end within Harrogate; these trips are generally short (less than 2.6km/1.6miles on average), are primarily commuter trips and are mostly made by car. These trips have a significant impact upon congestion in the town but also present significant potential to shift journeys to more sustainable modes, particularly walking and cycling. In terms of carbon and Air quality concerns the minimal journey time increase and modal shift means expectation is that Carbon is neutral – subject to detailed air quality modelling as part of next design phase.

Impact on local businesses	Concerns were based on the perception that trade relies on the ability to drive into and park in the town centre. The proposal retains the ability to drive into the town centre, subject to the impacts discussed within the modelling and also to park in the town centre. Whilst some parking spaces would be lost to accommodate the scheme, it will still be possible to park in the town centre Whilst some parking spaces would be lost to accommodate the scheme, it will still be possible to park in the town centre. Parking studies indicate a significant surplus (500 spaces) in the town centre during most of the year and at peak occupancy there are 120 unused on street spaces. Concerns were raised over the loading and delivery requirements for local businesses. The scheme will be developed to take full account of loading requirements for the businesses – the scheme is currently at an early stage and as we move into more detailed design we will ensure that traders are fully consulted to ensure that loading requirements are accommodated.
Impact on local residents	There are concerns that traffic redistributing from Station Parade would impact upon residents of neighbouring streets. The modelling undertaken predicts that under the peak period there could be a reassignment of c. 200 vehicles away from Station Parade in an hour. This is split across a number of alternative routes; the level of increase predicted on any street is less than 3 vehicles per minute.

	Full pedestrianisation	Partial pedestrianisation	Retain vehicular access	Neither
James Street	**45.5 (411)**	**16.6 (150)**	**32.0 (289)**	**6.0 (54)**

Opposition to Pedestrianisation Theme	Response
Traffic Flow and congestion	Concerns centred on impacts to traffic flow and the potential for congestion by implementing pedestrianisation on James Street. The worst case modelling for Station Parade 1 lane Option includes James Street being fully pedestrianised and is therefore included in the statement that average journey time could increase by 1m14s
Impact on local businesses	Concerns were based on the perception that trade relies on the ability to drive into and park in the town centre. The ability to drive to and park in the town centre is retained under all options, however under the full pedestrianisation option parking is removed from the eastern section of James Street. Studies have shown significant benefits to business performance from public realm improvements, The pedestrian pound, the business case for better streets and places by Just economics is a much-quoted reference point helping individuals and organisations make the economic case for investing in better streets – with a focus on pedestrianisation. The study found outlines the impact of public realm improvements on business performance:

	• Case study evidence suggests that well-planned improvements to these public spaces can boost footfall and trading by up to 40%. • Investing in better streets and spaces for walking can provide a competitive return compared to other transport projects; walking and cycling projects can increase retails sales by 30%. • Evaluations of pedestrian improvements in Coventry and Bristol show a 25% increase in footfall on Saturdays and predict £1.4million benefits respectively. • It is often assumed that more parking is the answer to struggling high streets. However across Europe, studies have linked the quality of public spaces to people's perceptions of attractiveness of an area, contributing towards their quality of life and influencing where they shop. • Many car journeys are short and as the volume of goods purchased is small, these trips could be made on foot or by bike. Furthermore, evidence shows us that, per square meter, cycle parking delivers five times higher retail spend than the same area of car parking. • Retailers have been shown to over-estimate the importance of the car for customer travel. In these studies, more people actually walked, cycled or came by bus. • The way we shop has changed and so have our expectations of the high street. Shoppers now seek to 'experience' something different and we need to know more about how better streets can add to that experience.

Highlight Harrogate suggestions received

Comment	Action
The lack of synchronisation between traffic signals and pedestrian crossing causes issues within the town centre	As part of the proposals the synchronisation of traffic signals will be investigated and optimised to work with the final design
Existing Taxi access can be difficult particularly for people getting in taxis on Station Parade	Taxi rank provision will be reviewed and where possible improved, particularly through identification of space for rear loading taxis
Cambridge Street requires improvement – can the money be spent here?	Whilst not within the TCF project scope options for improvement of Cambridge Street will be further explored
The proposals should focus more on tree planting and greenery.	The next stage of scheme design will allow for more detailed proposals in respect of the planting throughout the scheme.
Harrogate would benefit from a Park and Ride service.	Whilst not within the TCF project scope, there are wider initiatives looking at options other such as Park and Ride, which would require alternative funding sources.

Skipton Highlight Themes

	Very Positive	Positive	Neutral	Negative	Very Negative	Don't Know
Broughton Road	**24.3 (27)**	**30.6 (34)**	**17.1 (19)**	**10.8 (12)**	**17.1 (19)**	**0**

Negative Responses Theme	Response
The new road layout will not improve traffic flow and access for vehicles	The aims of the scheme are to make improvements that support sustainable and inclusive modes of transport, in order to achieve this in a balanced way traffic modelling has been undertaken to demonstrate that the network will continue to operate efficiently for vehicles.
Configuration of the Cycle lanes – the current configuration crosses Broughton Road twice in order to deal with the Belmont Bridge pinch point and accessibility issues on the southern side of Broughton Road – experienced cyclists may just use the road for convenience and less experienced cyclists may not use them due to the on-road section across the bridge	Belmont Bridge is a significant constraint and the introduction of crossings is necessary to enable the maximum length of segregated cycle lane – further review of the alignment and design will be conducted during preliminary and detailed design to optimise provision for both experienced and inexperienced cyclists

Length of the Cycle Lanes – Questioning of the usefulness of the lanes without a wider network connecting to them	The Transforming Cities Fund proposals represent an opportunity to provide walking and cycling infrastructure between the town centre and railway station. Whilst the funding envelope doesn't allow for more connectivity as part of this project, this infrastructure provides a core link which can be developed and expanded as further funding sources become available – the route was identified as a key link as part of the Local Cycling & Walking Infrastructure Plan and its development supports the wider strategy within the town.
Residents & Blue Badge parking – The requirement to remove on road parking at Belle Vue terrace and removal of ability for blue badge holders to park along Broughton Road will cause inconvenience	Following further design work it may still be necessary to remove parking outside Belle Vue Terrace and the inconvenience this would present to some residents and the Dental practice is acknowledged. We will work with these parties to continue to explore alternative parking options to mitigate this inconvenience if this is necessary.
Concerns over access for emergency service vehicles	Whilst some restrictions to vehicle access will be introduced, the scheme will ensure emergency vehicle access is maintained at all times. The detailed design will ensure that emergency vehicles will be able to safely use any new road layout – designs are tested using the tracking for different types of vehicles to ensure they can be accommodated.
Conflict between bus stops and cycle lanes on Broughton Road – how can bus users safely board the bus where segregated cycle lanes are proposed?	Buses remain an important part of the sustainable transport mix. The scheme will ensure provision is implemented to enable bus users to safely board the bus without conflicting with cyclists.

Skipton Highlight suggestions

Comment	Action
The alignment of the cycle lanes along Broughton Road may discourage their use by some cyclists	The configuration of the proposed cycle Lanes will be reviewed as part of the next stage of design to optimise Broughton Road for all cyclists
The proposals do not set out how provision for buses using the railway station is catered for	The next stage of design will clearly show how busses are provided for within the proposals, particularly within the railway station car park and along Broughton Road
Signage is needed on Keighley Road where there is no right turn for vehicles	This will be considered as part of the ongoing design process

Selby Highlight Themes

	Very Positive	Positive	Neutral	Negative	Very Negative	Don't Know
Ousegate 1 way	**36.4 (39)**	**20.6 (22)**	**11.2 (12)**	**11.2 (12)**	**18.7 (20)**	**1.9 (2)**

Negative Responses Theme	Response
Impact on Congestion and air pollution	Concerns centred on impacts to traffic flow and the potential for congestion and increases in air pollution by making Ousegate one-way northbound between Cowie Drive and the junction of the A19. Traffic modelling has been undertaken to understand the impacts of the Selby Station Gateway. With signalling mitigations applied at the Ousgeate/A19 and New Street/Crescent St junctions, proposals demonstrate a negligible impact on junction delay and congestion in the AM peak and overall balanced impact in the PM peak. The AM peak sees very little change with the largest delay change at a junction being 13 seconds which is a decrease in delay coming from Scott Rd at the Gowthorpe junction. The main delay changes in the PM are going eastbound on the A19 at Ousegate, the Park St arm on the Station Rd junction and Scott Rd at the Gowthorpe junction. The largest of these changes is again a delay decrease at Scott Rd. Further to this the delay increases seen at are due to longer wait times at signals and not the junctions becoming over capacity due to the scheme. To conclude the SATURN modelling shows no significant negative impact on congestion. Local junction modelling further demonstrates that junctions perform within capacity across both traffic peaks. Similarly, to the impacts stated above capacity improvements are anticipated in AM Peak and a slight worsening is anticipated in the PM Peak. Sensitivity testing

	has demonstrated that with future growth some junctions exceed capacity both with and without the TCF proposals, contributing to a potential increase in future levels of congestion thus further increasing the need for modal shift to alternative modes of travel. Detailed air quality modelling will be completed using the outputs from the traffic model to understand the impact of the scheme on levels of air pollution. Mitigation measures will be explored throughout the next design phase to control pollutant exceedances, including the use of smart signalling technology to platoon traffic through sensitive locations avoiding idling. These scenarios do not take in to account the anticipated benefits of increased modal shift as a result of this and other active travel schemes and changes to patterns of travel post COVID.

	Very Positive	Positive	Neutral	Negative	Very Negative	Don't Know
Close Denison Bridge to vehicles	**23.5 (23)**	**22.4 (22)**	**18.4 (18)**	**22.4 (22)**	**13.3 (13)**	**0.0 (0)**

Negative Responses Theme	Response
Congestion & impact on local journeys	The Denison Road bridge is well used by both pedestrians and cyclists. Currently there is no dedicated provision for these user groups to cross the canal in this location. The closure of the narrow, weight restricted canal road bridge to vehicular traffic ensures pedestrians and cyclists can use the bridge safely and reduces traffic flows along Ousegate. The majority of current vehicular trips using the canal bridge are travelling locally across Selby, within a maximum 15-minute cycle ride of their origin and destination. By improving the attractiveness of walking and cycling facilities it is expected that some these short distance trips will transfer away from private car use. In future years, vehicles previously using the Denison Road Bridge are expected to re-route via the strategic road network, including the A1014 Bawtry Road, Abbot's Road and the A19.

Selby Highlight Suggestions

Comment	Action
The proposed path alignments through the park are very straight and don't respect the character of the park	Through detailed design we will develop the final path alignment based on stakeholder feedback to achieve the most sensitive possible option
Reduction in drop off spaces will make it more difficult to use the station	Continued review of drop off and parking space provision